Pakistan-Turkmenistan Relations: Evaluating the Progress on TAPI

Mir Sherbaz Khetran*

Abstract

Turkmenistan and Pakistan enjoy mutually respectful and cordial relations underpinned by history, culture and religion. Both countries value people-to-people ties and underscore the need to further augment bilateral cooperation in a variety of fields. China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), a component of Belt and Road Initiative (BRI), provides an opportunity to enhance bilateral cooperation and shift the focus of relationship to addressing socio-economic challenges, building economic linkages and enhancing bilateral trade. Turkmenistan-Afghanistan-Pakistan-India (TAPI) gas pipeline is one of the most effective development projects since the countries of the region are energy starved. The collective address to the common handicap will also play a vital role in the regional economic upswing. Most importantly, new avenues of cooperation can promote a common understanding of evolving regional and international issues of interest to both countries.

Keywords: Turkmenistan-Pakistan Relations, TAPI, CPEC, Central Asia.

Introduction

In the past, Pakistan did not enjoy strong economic and political relations with the Central Asian States, despite having centuries-old religious, political, cultural and commercial connections. However, Pakistan’s recent economic initiatives have brought the two regions closer. The most significant multilateral initiative includes Turkmenistan-Afghanistan-Pakistan-India (TAPI).

TAPI natural gas pipeline is a project of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) that aims to benefit the South Asian and Central Asian regions through connectivity and mutual dependence. Upon completion, it is expected to be able to export up to 33 billion cubic meters of natural gas.

* The author is Research Fellow, China-Pakistan Study Centre (CPSC), Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad.
Pakistan-Turkmenistan Relations

gas per year through an approximately 1,815-kilometer long pipeline.¹ This pipeline will begin from Turkmenistan’s Galkynysh and adjacent oil fields and pass through Afghanistan, Pakistan and India. The project started a decade ago, in 2008, and was estimated to cost up to US$7.6 billion.² Afghanistan’s commitment to protect the pipeline in the areas that are under government’s control has added to the optimism surrounding the project.

Turkmengaz is the consortium leader for the TAPI project and subsequently will be contributing some 85 per cent of equity. The other three members of the project ─ Afghanistan, India and Pakistan ─ will each make five per cent each equity share in the project company. As planned, Pakistan and India will receive 1.325 billion cubic feet per day (bcfd) gas each from the resource-rich Central Asian partner and Afghanistan will get a share of 0.5 bcfd gas.³

There are also other clear benefits for the countries in question. For instance, Afghanistan is expected to earn nearly US$400 million annually in transit duties. Moreover, the advantages are not just monetary or direct. After all, with projects such as TAPI, the landlocked countries such as Turkmenistan will have an opportunity to diversify its gas exports to the East where a growing demand for energy is becoming a pressing need. Turkmenistan is known for its huge gas reserves and ranks as the sixth largest in the world. However, it only has access to the Russian, Iran and Chinese markets. Adding neighbouring gas scarce countries like Afghanistan, Pakistan and India thus adds much value to its exports.⁴

As for the client countries of the energy through TAPI, i.e., Afghanistan, Pakistan and India, the benefit is quite clear in the form of a steady supply of affordable gas to power their growing energy demands and industries. Afghanistan requires a safe energy source to raise both its capacity to produce electricity and increase the current electrification rate from 20 per

---

¹ Muhammad Amanov, TAPI Pipeline Project, Presentation for Pakistan Government, Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad, December 6, 2019.
² Ibid.
³ TAPI Pipeline to Help Address Energy Shortage in Pakistan, Asian Development Bank, April 7, 2016.
cent to 33 per cent. Pakistan also suffers from power shortage of around 5000 MW that has seen domestic and industrial issues being raised in the country and which will be ameliorated by the inflow of steady gas through TAPI.\(^5\)

As in India, such a large project will help develop a conducive environment for trade and economic growth while also providing jobs and reducing unrest. Overall, the project will also help bring together these four countries by aligning their interest and creating mutual dependence on a product of value for all of them. Thus, it is not unreasonably expected to play a role in the regional stability. There is also the significant matter of using natural gas to generate electricity that reduces environmental damage since natural gas emits 43 per cent fewer carbon emissions than coal. This is particularly important in case of India where coal is used commonly to generate electricity.

TAPI, therefore, presents tremendous prospects for regional collaboration and support on an unprecedented level, especially of the four countries involved, as it hooks their interests, understands their needs, and helps their economies. It is one of the links in the inter-energy relationship among the Central Asian Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) countries and it is strategically aligned with CAREC’ objectives which, according to Zabihullah Mudabber, are of ensuring energy security through balanced development of regional infrastructure and institutions, stronger integration of markets and economic growth through enhanced energy trading. As a result, it is a high priority flagship project in the energy sector under CAREC 2020.\(^6\)

With this background, this paper addresses the following two key questions about Pakistan and Turkmenistan, their relations, and on-going projects that have the potential to add significant value to bilateral as well as regional dynamics: a.) How can relations between Pakistan and Turkmenistan be improved? b.)What role can TAPI play to connect Central Asia and Pakistan? This study is qualitative in nature and a triangulation method has been used at data collection stage. The secondary source data used in this

\(^5\) Ibid.
research includes documents based on content analysis, historical descriptions and comparative and analytical reports. The documents include government publications, organisational reports, academic research papers, newspapers, books, journals and electronic sources.

**Regional Connectivity and Relations with Turkmenistan**

Since independence in 1991, Turkmenistan has enjoyed friendly relations with Pakistan. Both countries are cooperating with each other in many fields. Turkmenistan can be beneficial for Pakistan as an energy grid for industry and economy. Concrete measures have already been taken after the realisation of this energy potential and, since then, economic prospects between the two nations seemed very bright and promising.\(^7\)

Turkmenistan offers the opportunity for lucrative energy trade with India as well as deep sea port facilities through Pakistan’s Gwadar port in order to gain access to the Arabian Sea for trade of energy sources. Moreover, it is of great importance for Pakistan’s Vision 2025 and its goals for regional connectivity. This mutual cooperation has entered into a new phase after the visit of the President of Turkmenistan to Pakistan on March 16-17, 2017. He was warmly welcomed. In fact, it was the third meeting between the then Prime Minister of Pakistan, Nawaz Sharif and President of Turkmenistan, Gurbanguly which was a sign of the rapid growth of diplomatic and economic relations between the two countries. Earlier, Nawaz Sharif had visited Ashgabat twice in May and December 2016, respectively.\(^8\)

This growing relationship between the two countries holds immense potential in terms of regional connectivity. Both countries agreed to strengthen bilateral relations especially to counter terrorism and cooperate in energy. Terrorism is an existential threat and undermines socio-economic development endeavours. In a joint media conference with Gurban guly in Islamabad, the then Prime Minister of Pakistan, Nawaz Sharif stressed to

---


work collectively to eradicate both terrorism and extremism while asserting that combating common threats is a mutual goal for both countries.9

Pakistan is committed to complete the TAPI gas pipeline project as early as possible. Pakistan’s former Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif said that TAPI was not merely a gas project; rather it was a trade and transit corridor as well. It could be comprised of gas pipeline, fiber optic lines, electricity transmission lines and road links besides establishing economic zones in order to connect Turkmenistan with Pakistan. Furthermore, TAPI is a mega project that has the potential to eradicate Pakistan’s energy crisis. The local industry can run at its full potential with this additional input of energy supply.

Pakistan and Turkmenistan can be connected through rail links that can also provide a linkage between Iran and Kazakhstan. Such regional connectivity ties between Pakistan and Turkmenistan would lay down the foundation of solid cooperation for years to come. With the agreement of TAPI pipeline between Turkmenistan, Afghanistan, Pakistan and India, ties with Turkmenistan started to gain significant strength. This 1815 km long pipeline starts from Galkynysh gas field Turkmenistan to Fazilka in India through Afghanistan and Pakistan. A large part of this project (827 km) will pass through Pakistan and work on this started in January 2017. It was planned to be completed by the end of 2019.10

This gas project will not only provide opportunities for the regional connectivity to the stakeholders but will also help in building new momentum of confidence. Pakistan signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with Turkmenistan to import 1000 MW electricity through Afghanistan. During the visit of Turkmenistan’s President to Pakistan, eight different agreements were signed between public and private sectors including on issues of curbing money laundering and eradicating terrorism. The other agreements include cooperation in financial intelligence matters, cooperation in the field of energy, while another MoU was signed in the field of education.

In the fiscal year 2016-17, bilateral trade between the two countries was around US$ 25 million which is quite low and needs to be increased. The gas pipeline project will help increase the trust of energy rich Turkmenistan to invest in Pakistan. The most lucrative investment areas for Turkmenistan include agriculture, minerals and mines, medicine, pharmaceutical and sports goods. Through these prospects of energy trade, the ties between Turkmenistan and Pakistan will touch new heights in the coming years, if Pakistani organisations can sustain the momentum and ascertain stability, security, diplomatic and trade prioritisation towards the region and a focus on social development.

**Pakistan – A Beneficiary of TAPI**

The TAPI gas pipeline has been under discussion since 2001 and aims to supply gas from Turkmenistan to Pakistan and India via Afghanistan. The ADB is continuously providing coordinating facility since the initiation of the project.\(^\text{11}\) Several meetings and sessions have been held for the preparatory phase which laid the foundation of the TAPI Pipeline Company Limited in November 2014 for technical assistance.\(^\text{12}\) Ashgabat decided to become the Consortium Leader in the 22nd TAPI steering committee meeting and was unanimously endorsed. The office was established in Dubai while the project and the company are led by Turkmenistan.\(^\text{13}\)

The TAPI pipeline project has the potential to provide substantial benefit to all four member countries. Inarguably, it is one of the biggest projects in the region. This project has a total length of 1815 km including 214 km in Turkmenistan, 774 KM in Afghanistan and 827 kilometers in Pakistan before reaching India. It is a long-term project that will take 30 years to complete with an estimated cost of US$9.9 billion.\(^\text{14}\)

---


\(^\text{12}\) Richard Pomfret and Patricia Sourdin, “Global Value-Chains and Connectivity in Developing AsiaWith Application to the Central and West Asian Region.” (2014).


TAPI has the capacity to supply 33 billion cubic meters gas from Dualatabad in Turkmenistan which is world’s fourth largest natural gas reserve. Out of the total supply, Pakistan and India will receive 42 percent each and the rest of the 16 per cent will be supplied to Afghanistan. Afghanistan will also receive US$400 million per year from the transit revenue other than its gas share.\textsuperscript{15}

Map No. 1
Route of TAPI

The construction of the project started from the Turkmenistan section back in December 2015. On February 23, 2018, a ceremony was held for the Afghanistan section which was attended by the Afghan and Turkmen Presidents, the Pakistani Prime Minister and the Indian Foreign Minister in Herat. The project is of great importance for all four member countries as it has the potential to resolve the energy crisis of India and Pakistan on the one hand while, on the other hand, it provides a great opportunity to

Turkmenistan to export its energy resource and generate income opportunities for Afghanistan. TAPI’s successful completion will also create a shift in the regional outlook and help resolve political issues of the member states.\textsuperscript{16}

Turkmenistan has abundant natural gas resources as Daulatabad is the largest field of the country and one of the largest in the world. However, unfortunately, it has a bumpy track record of exports. China, Russia and Iran remained key destinations for Turkmenistan’s gas export. However, Russia stopped purchase in 2016 due to prices issues, while Iran also stopped buying this gas in 2017 due to payment issue. This leaves China as the only importer of Turkmen gas.\textsuperscript{17}

Turkmenistan provides gas supply to China through three gas pipelines via Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan. To boost the gas supply, the Chinese President, Xi Jinping approved a fourth line which has the capacity to deliver 30 bcm gas to the western China annually through Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan. However, construction work was officially suspended in March 2017 due to internal disputes of member states. This proved to be a big blow to Turkmenistan’s export based economy. In such circumstances, TAPI has become a priority and a ray of hope to stabilise the Turkmen economy.\textsuperscript{18}

Pakistan is one of the largest Turkmen gas consumers with respect to the TAPI project. Pakistan has suffered a great deal due to energy crisis both at domestic and industrial levels. The energy crisis is so grave an issue for Pakistan that it is used as a part of election manifestos by political parties. Natural gas is used at household, commercial levels and for electricity generation in the country. Its total natural gas production stands at four bcfd but its consumption is six billion cubic feet per day.\textsuperscript{19} By 2025, this production is expected to fall by less than one bcfd due to depletion of natural resources while its demand will increase up to eight bcfd. Thus, the

\textsuperscript{17} Mukhtar Ahmad Bhat, “The Role of Energy In Iran-Turkmenistan Relations,” Central Asia & the Caucasus (14046091) 18, no. 4 (2017).
The TAPI gas pipeline project is extremely crucial to bridge the natural gas production and consumption gap in Pakistan.

The energy shortage in Pakistan has resulted in electricity and gas outages which has seriously affected the textile industry. The severity of the effects can be observed from the facts and figures of only four years (2008-2012) in which almost 40 per cent of textile industry of Pakistan was shifted to Bangladesh due to uneven gas and electricity supply. According to the data provided by Pakistan Textile Export Association, gas price in Bangladesh is US$3/mmbtu, Vietnam US$4.2 and in India US$4.5 whereas in Pakistan it was US $7.6 in December 2017.

Pakistan Textile Export Association also reported that this price will be further increased to US$11/mmbtu as the government decided to supply degasified liquefied natural gas to the industrial sector. This energy crisis has wide-ranging economic implications including increase in production costs which ultimately leads to decrease in export that further widens the trade deficit. In the last fiscal year, the trade deficit reached its record height of around US$32 billion.

One of the fast growing economies of the world, India is the final destination of the TAPI project. However, it has almost the same energy crisis issues like Pakistan. To meet its energy needs, India has to import gas. The Indian oil imports have been increased by 29 per cent in the fiscal year 2017-2018 which is almost US$85-90 billion in terms of value. India is ranked in the top three countries in the world with respect to oil imports. The gas demand has been increasing day by day due to its use in the power sector, fertilizers and environment friendly policies.

It is estimated that currently natural gas accounts for 6.5 per cent in the total energy consumption of India which will be more than double and reach 15 percent by 2022. India is importing 8.5 million tons of LNG from Qatar.

---

annually and 3.5 million tons from the US to meet its domestic needs but still failed to meet its demand. Therefore, TAPI project seems to be of great importance very crucial to fulfil energy demand of India.\textsuperscript{24}

The TAPI project is important due to export expansion of Turkmenistan and dire energy demand of Pakistan and India. However, due to geostrategic and political preferences, such mega projects have to face many hurdles. For example, the regional outlook and political interest of Pakistan contradict with both Afghanistan and India which has some definite implications on this project. At the same time, the TAPI project can help to normalise the contradictory situation between member states. Thus, its importance as an instrument of economic diplomacy cannot be underestimated.

The transit revenue for Afghanistan, in TAPI gas pipeline project, is just a tip of the iceberg. After completion of the project, the country will be provided an opportunity for new regional connectivity, trade opportunity and transit project like CASA-1000 electricity transmission line. It will also serve as a transit avenue for expanded Lapis Lazuli Corridor and Kyrgyzstan. The agreement between Turkmenistan and Pakistan signed for power project will provide 500 kilovolts energy via Afghanistan under TAPI-500 project. TAPI will also help in mainstreaming Afghanistan’s true potential as a trade and transit hub in the region especially in the context of Central Asia with Middle East and South Asia.\textsuperscript{25}

Due to TAPI, India has developed close relationship with Afghanistan and started investing in the country. The Chabahar port project is a prominent example. This project includes 215 km Zaranj-Delaram road which has faced great many challenges during its construction but they have never given up and have completed it. The Chabahar port serves as a gateway for India to reach Central Asia.\textsuperscript{26}

In the Nimroz province of Afghanistan, the Taliban have given tough time during the construction of the Zaaranj-Delaram road. It is the same area

\textsuperscript{24} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{26} Nagesh Kumar, “Potential and Prospects of Strengthening Transport Connectivity for Regional Economic Integration in Southern Asia,” South Asia Economic Journal 16, no. 2_suppl (2015): 39S-54S.
from where TAPI pipeline will pass through. Pakistan has assured its support for the completion of TAPI. In the inaugural ceremony held in December 2015, the then Minister of Water and Power and Defence of Pakistan stated that Pakistan will use all its influence over the Taliban to ensure TAPI’s successful and secure completion. Successful completion of this project will provide strategic depth to all three member statements including Afghanistan, Pakistan and India.\footnote{Gareth Price, “Afghanistan and its Neighbours: Forging Regional Engagement,” \textit{Chatham House}, May 1, 2015.}

**Challenges to TAPI**

One of the most serious challenges to the success of TAPI and its potential are the unstable — if not altogether acrimonious — bilateral relations between India, Pakistan, and Afghanistan. The political, economic and security issues that ensue from these tense diplomatic ties imply that the region, at large, remains underdeveloped in terms of its potential for mutual collaborations and planning. The most obvious concern of course is for trade routes, which remain unutilised and backward. Thus, the oft-quoted potential and mineral resources of the region remain just rhetoric and even open to exploitation from foreign actors and terrorists. Afghanistan is counted as having 56 per cent of its population as multidimensional poor using 2015-16 data, while India at 27.5 per cent (from 2015-16) and Pakistan at 44 per cent (2012-13) are also not far behind.\footnote{“Multidimensional Poverty Index: Developing Countries,” \textit{United Nations Human Development Programme}, http://hdr.undp.org/en/composite/MPI} Therefore, the biggest beneficiary of this project is the common masses of Pakistan, Afghanistan and India.

Overcoming the hurdles in relationships is, thus, in the interests of all the countries involved. This is, however, not an easy task since Pakistan and India have been embroiled in a perpetual conflict since their inception in 1947. Geopolitics also plays their part as South Asia has historically been under the spotlight, such as in the Cold War. The turmoil in Afghanistan further adds to this complexity. However, this makes projects such as TAPI even more important, as they can possibly be useful for generating goodwill, dependence and prosperity.
Conclusion

TAPI is a mega gas project connecting the energy rich Central Asian state, Turkmenistan, with the South Asian states of Afghanistan, Pakistan and India. The above discussion proves that TAPI can symbolise greater connectivity and become part of the process to improve the stunted ties shared by its South Asian members. As a result, it can play a major part in ushering these countries towards a pathway of regional growth and ultimately benefit all their populations. This, however, requires a deeper understanding of its potential from all the stakeholders and even more important, a willingness and long-term commitment to develop a collaborative approach of which TAPI can be a significant first step.

When this project was inaugurated in December 2015 in Herat, senior representatives of all four countries took part in the ceremony and voiced their hope for its prospective future. This is highly encouraging since it indicates the state level support to the project of TAPI. Further developments have since been observed as well that reflect more awareness of the need to jointly develop the region at large, such as through groundbreaking ceremonies jointly organised by Turkmenistan and Afghanistan for various stages of the project. It must be noted that, beyond the rhetoric of collaboration and regional development, there are practical and economic considerations that make TAPI both worthwhile and attractive to all the member countries.

TAPI promises to supply 33 billion cubic meters gas per year to Afghanistan, Pakistan and India which will go a long way to ease the energy demands of these countries, while also being a great source of income for Turkmenistan. Turkmenistan is one of the leading gas rich countries in the world looking to gain from this resource in areas where it is demanded, while India and Pakistan are facing acute energy crises and Afghanistan has severe economic challenges, all of which can benefit greatly from the gas that TAPI will bring. The major hurdle, apart from faltering bilateral relations, is the concern with insecurity and instability in Afghanistan which remains an ever-present problem when it comes to large projects such as TAPI. The consensus, thus, is that Afghanistan needs to be secured before TAPI’s true potential can be realized. The paradox also is that while TAPI requires stability in Afghanistan, it will also be a source of stability by providing transit finances and creating employment for the Afghan people.
The TAPI project is much anticipated as it will provide peace politics between India, Pakistan and Afghanistan. However, there are obstacles such as the strong competition it faces from other energy projects like the Iran-Pakistan gas pipeline project. TAPI, however, has the support of the US, which is a prospective sign. In such circumstances the project requires seriousness, willingness and spirit of cooperation for successful implementation.\textsuperscript{29}

As far as Pakistan is concerned, there has been a paradigm shift in the country’s foreign policy, which is reflected in the powerful support for TAPI. It appears that Pakistan has realised the strategic importance of Central Asian states for a smooth and easy supply of energy to boost its depleting resources and for the greater socio-economic connectivity. As a result, despite some security risks, several potential benefits have led to a policy of strengthening bilateral relations with Turkmenistan as well as its larger region. The Pakistani Prime Minister visited all the Central Asian States in 2015 and several MoUs have been signed in diversified fields of economy, trade, commerce, tourism, education and energy. The pace of bilateral relations with Turkmenistan is of special concern as it can help to overcome the energy crisis of Pakistan through TAPI.

The TAPI project will prove to be a lifeline for Pakistan as it will help to eradicate the energy crisis directly which ultimately will help to re-establish the textile industry which have been shifted to other countries like Bangladesh due to the energy crisis. This is a significant concern for the country. TAPI will also provide an opportunity to Pakistan for closer ties with its neighbouring countries especially India and Afghanistan which Pakistan has been attempting with varying but limited levels of success in recent years. TAPI may well be the most realistic and practical way to develop these ties.\textsuperscript{30} It is for all these reasons that the TAPI project has been highlighted by multiple stakeholders in all the participating countries and should thus be followed with commitment, resolve and foresight.


\textsuperscript{30} Christopher Snedden, \textit{Shifting Geo politics in the Greater South Asia Region}, Asia-Pacific Centre for Security Studies Honolulu, United States, 2016.